# Structure and transitions of nucleon excitations from lattice QCD

#### Finn M. Stokes Waseem Kamleh, Derek B. Leinweber

Jülich Supercomputing Centre Forschunszentrum Jülich

Centre for the Subatomic Structure of Matter The University of Adelaide

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

#### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

Use these optimised operators to construct relevant three point correlation functions

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

#### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

Use these optimised operators to construct relevant three point correlation functions

#### Step 4: Extract form factors

Take ratios of three point to two point functions and extract e.g.  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$ 

• Discretise quantum chromodynamics on finite 4D lattice



- Discretise quantum chromodynamics on finite 4D lattice
  - Here  $32^3 \times 64$  lattice sites



- Discretise quantum chromodynamics on finite 4D lattice
  - Here  $32^3 \times 64$  lattice sites
  - $\blacktriangleright$  Separated by  $\sim 0.1\,\text{fm}$



- Discretise quantum chromodynamics on finite 4D lattice
  - Here  $32^3 \times 64$  lattice sites
  - $\blacktriangleright\,$  Separated by  $\sim 0.1\,\text{fm}$

#### Partition function

$$Z = \int \mathcal{D} U^{\mu} \exp(-S_G) \det(M)$$



- Discretise quantum chromodynamics on finite 4D lattice
  - Here  $32^3 \times 64$  lattice sites
  - $\blacktriangleright\,$  Separated by  $\sim 0.1\,\text{fm}$

#### Partition function

$$Z = \int {\cal D} U^{\mu} \, \exp(-S_G) \, \det(M)$$



•  $m_{\pi} = 156-702 \, {
m MeV}$ 

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

#### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

Use these optimised operators to construct relevant three point correlation functions

#### Step 4: Extract form factors

Take ratios of three point to two point functions and extract e.g.  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$ 

• Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon

- Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon
- We use local three-quark spin-1/2 nucleon operators

$$\chi_1 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top} (C\gamma_5) d^b \right] u^c$$
  
$$\chi_2 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top} (C) d^b \right] \gamma_5 u^c$$

- Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon
- We use local three-quark spin-1/2 nucleon operators

$$\chi_1 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C\gamma_5) d^b \right] u^c$$
  
$$\chi_2 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C) d^b \right] \gamma_5 u^c$$

- Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon
- We use local three-quark spin-1/2 nucleon operators

$$\chi_1 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C\gamma_5) d^b \right] u^c$$
  
$$\chi_2 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C) d^b \right] \gamma_5 u^c$$

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(oldsymbol{p};\,t)\equiv\sum_{oldsymbol{x}}\mathrm{e}^{ioldsymbol{p}\cdotoldsymbol{x}}\,\langle\Omega|\chi^i(x)\,\overline{\chi}^j(0)|\Omega
angle$$

- Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon
- We use local three-quark spin-1/2 nucleon operators

$$\chi_1 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C\gamma_5) d^b \right] u^c$$
  
$$\chi_2 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C) d^b \right] \gamma_5 u^c$$

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \sum_{\boldsymbol{x}} \mathrm{e}^{i \boldsymbol{p} \cdot \boldsymbol{x}} \langle \Omega | \chi^i(\boldsymbol{x}) \, \overline{\chi}^j(\boldsymbol{0}) | \Omega \rangle$$

- Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon
- We use local three-quark spin-1/2 nucleon operators

$$\chi_1 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C\gamma_5) d^b \right] u^c$$
  
$$\chi_2 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C) d^b \right] \gamma_5 u^c$$

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(oldsymbol{p};\,t)\equiv\sum_{oldsymbol{x}}\mathrm{e}^{ioldsymbol{p}\cdotoldsymbol{x}}\,\langle\Omega|\chi^i(oldsymbol{x})\,\overline{\chi}^j(0)|\Omega
angle$$

- Combine quark fields to get quantum numbers of nucleon
- We use local three-quark spin-1/2 nucleon operators

$$\chi_1 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C\gamma_5) d^b \right] u^c$$
  
$$\chi_2 = \epsilon^{abc} \left[ u^{a\top}(C) d^b \right] \gamma_5 u^c$$

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p};\,t)\equiv\sum_{\boldsymbol{x}}\mathrm{e}^{i\boldsymbol{p}\cdot\boldsymbol{x}}\,\left\langle \Omega|\chi^{i}(x)\,\overline{\chi}^{j}(0)|\Omega
ight
angle$$

## Correlation function $G_{11}(\Gamma_+; \mathbf{0}; t)$



Finn M. Stokes (JSC)



Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

#### $G_{ij}(\Gamma; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \operatorname{Tr} \Gamma \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)$

• Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

$$u_+(0,\uparrow) = \begin{pmatrix} 1\\ 0\\ 0\\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

$$u_+(0,\uparrow)=egin{pmatrix}1\0\0\0\end{pmatrix}\qquad u_-(0,\uparrow)=egin{pmatrix}0\0\-1\0\end{pmatrix}$$

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

$$u_+(0,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix} 0\ 1\ 0\ 0\ \end{pmatrix} \qquad u_-(0,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix} 0\ 0\ 0\ -1\ \end{pmatrix}$$

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

$$u_+(p,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix} 0\ 1\ rac{p_1-ip_2}{E+m}\ rac{-p_3}{E+m}\end{pmatrix} \qquad u_-(p,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix} rac{-p_1+ip_2}{E+m}\ rac{p_3}{E+m}\ 0\ -1\end{pmatrix}$$

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

 $G_{ij}(\Gamma; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \operatorname{Tr} \Gamma \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)$ 

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

$$u_+(p,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix} 0\ 1\ rac{p_1-ip_2}{E+m}\ rac{-p_3}{E+m}\end{pmatrix} \qquad u_-(p,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix} rac{-p_1+ip_2}{E+m}\ rac{p_3}{E+m}\ 0\ -1\end{pmatrix}$$

• Works perfectly at zero momentum

#### Spinor-projected Correlation Matrix

#### $G_{ij}(\Gamma; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \operatorname{Tr} \Gamma \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)$

- Sum of exponentials corresponding to all states, from both parity sectors
- Use  ${\sf \Gamma}_{\pm}\equiv (\gamma_4\pm \mathbb{I})/2$  to access individual parity sectors
- Takes only upper (or lower) components of Dirac spinors:

$$u_+(p,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix}0\1\rac{p_1-ip_2}{E+m}\-rac{-p_3}{E+m}\end{pmatrix}\qquad u_-(p,\downarrow)=egin{pmatrix}rac{-p_1+ip_2}{E+m}\rac{p_3}{E+m}\0\-1\end{pmatrix}$$

- Works perfectly at zero momentum
- At non-zero momentum, opposite-parity contaminations come in at  $O(|\boldsymbol{p}|)$

Finn M. Stokes (JSC)

• Expand basis to simultaneously isolate finite momentum energy eigenstates, regardless of parity

- Expand basis to simultaneously isolate finite momentum energy eigenstates, regardless of parity
- Define PEVA projector

$$\Gamma_{\boldsymbol{p}} = rac{1}{4} (\mathbb{I} + \gamma_4) (\mathbb{I} - i \gamma_5 \gamma_k \hat{\boldsymbol{p}}_k)$$

- Expand basis to simultaneously isolate finite momentum energy eigenstates, regardless of parity
- Define PEVA projector

$$\Gamma_{oldsymbol{
ho}}=rac{1}{4}(\mathbb{I}+\gamma_4)(\mathbb{I}-i\gamma_5\gamma_k\hat{p}_k)$$

•  $\chi^i_{\pmb{p}} \equiv \Gamma_{\pmb{p}} \chi^i$  couples to positive parity states at zero momentum

- Expand basis to simultaneously isolate finite momentum energy eigenstates, regardless of parity
- Define PEVA projector

$$\Gamma_{oldsymbol{
ho}}=rac{1}{4}(\mathbb{I}+\gamma_4)(\mathbb{I}-i\gamma_5\gamma_k\hat{p}_k)$$

•  $\chi^{i}_{p} \equiv \Gamma_{p} \chi^{i}$  couples to positive parity states at zero momentum •  $\chi^{i'}_{p} \equiv \Gamma_{p} \gamma_{5} \chi^{i}$  couples to negative parity states at zero momentum

## PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0 \text{ GeV}^2$



## PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0 \text{ GeV}^2$


# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0 \text{ GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0 \text{ GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0 \text{ GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0.166 \text{ GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0.332 \, \text{GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0.498 \, \text{GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0.664 \text{ GeV}^2$



# PEVA correlation matrix $p^2 = 0.830 \text{ GeV}^2$



### Step 1: Construct correlation matrix

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

#### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

Use these optimised operators to construct relevant three point correlation functions

#### Step 4: Extract form factors

Take ratios of three point to two point functions and extract e.g.  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$ 

## Step 2: Perform variational analysis

• Seek operators  $\{\phi^{\alpha}_{{\pmb{p}}}\}$  that couple strongly to a single energy eigenstate

$$\phi^{\alpha}_{\boldsymbol{p}} = \sum_{i} v^{\alpha}_{i}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \chi^{i}_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \sum_{i'} v^{\alpha}_{i'}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \chi^{i'}_{\boldsymbol{p}}$$
$$\overline{\phi}^{\alpha}_{\boldsymbol{p}} = \sum_{i} u^{\alpha}_{i}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \overline{\chi}^{i}_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \sum_{i'} u^{\alpha}_{i'}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \overline{\chi}^{i'}_{\boldsymbol{p}}$$

## Step 2: Perform variational analysis

• Seek operators  $\{\phi^{\alpha}_{{\pmb{p}}}\}$  that couple strongly to a single energy eigenstate

$$\phi^{\alpha}_{\boldsymbol{p}} = \sum_{i} v^{\alpha}_{i}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \chi^{i}_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \sum_{i'} v^{\alpha}_{i'}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \chi^{i'}_{\boldsymbol{p}}$$
$$\overline{\phi}^{\alpha}_{\boldsymbol{p}} = \sum_{i} u^{\alpha}_{i}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \overline{\chi}^{i}_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \sum_{i'} u^{\alpha}_{i'}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ \overline{\chi}^{i'}_{\boldsymbol{p}}$$

• Coefficients can be found by solving generalised eigenvalue problem

$$\mathbf{v}^{\alpha}(\mathbf{p}) \ G(\mathbf{p}; t_0) = \exp(-E^{\alpha}(\mathbf{p}) \Delta t) \ \mathbf{v}^{\alpha}(\mathbf{p}) \ G(\mathbf{p}; t_0 + \Delta t)$$
$$G(\mathbf{p}; t_0) \ \mathbf{u}^{\alpha}(\mathbf{p}) = \exp(-E^{\alpha}(\mathbf{p}) \Delta t) \ G(\mathbf{p}; t_0 + \Delta t) \ \mathbf{u}^{\alpha}(\mathbf{p})$$

Eigenstate-projected correlation function

$$G_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p};\ t)\equivoldsymbol{v}^{lpha op}(oldsymbol{p})\ G(oldsymbol{p};\ t)\,oldsymbol{u}^{lpha}(oldsymbol{p})$$

Eigenstate-projected correlation function

$$G_{\alpha}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \boldsymbol{v}^{lpha op}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ G(\boldsymbol{p}; t) \, \boldsymbol{u}^{lpha}(\boldsymbol{p})$$

#### Effective energy

$$E^{ ext{eff}}_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p},t)\equivrac{1}{\delta t}\lnrac{G_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p};\,t)}{G_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p};\,t+\delta t)}$$

Eigenstate-projected correlation function

$$G_{\alpha}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \boldsymbol{v}^{lpha op}(\boldsymbol{p}) \ G(\boldsymbol{p}; t) \, \boldsymbol{u}^{lpha}(\boldsymbol{p})$$

### Effective energy

$$E^{ ext{eff}}_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p},t)\equivrac{1}{\delta t}\lnrac{G_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p};\,t)}{G_{lpha}(oldsymbol{p};\,t+\delta t)}$$

Expect  $E_{lpha}^{\mathrm{eff}}$  to approximately obey dispersion relation

$$E_{lpha}^{ ext{eff}}(oldsymbol{p},t)pprox\sqrt{m_{lpha}^2+oldsymbol{p}^2}$$

Ground state



First negative parity excitation



Second negative parity excitation



First positive parity excitation



## Effective energy

Nucleon spectrum



### Step 1: Construct correlation matrix

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

#### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

Use these optimised operators to construct relevant three point correlation functions

#### Step 4: Extract form factors

Take ratios of three point to two point functions and extract e.g.  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$ 









#### Matrix element

$$egin{aligned} &\langle B\,;\,p'\,;\,s'|\,j^\mu|\,B\,;\,p\,;\,s
ight
angle\propto \ &\overline{u}_Bigg(\gamma^\mu F_1(Q^2)-rac{\sigma^{\mu
u}q_
u}{2m_B}F_2(Q^2)igg)u_B \end{aligned}$$



### Matrix element

$$\langle B; p'; s' | j^{\mu} | B; p; s 
angle \propto$$
  
 $\overline{u}_B \left( \gamma^{\mu} F_1(Q^2) - rac{\sigma^{\mu
u} q_{
u}}{2m_B} F_2(Q^2) 
ight) u_B$ 

$$egin{aligned} G_E(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) - rac{Q^2}{2m_B}\,F_2(Q^2) \ G_M(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) + F_2(Q^2) \end{aligned}$$



### Matrix element

$$\langle B; p'; s' | j^{\mu} | B; p; s 
angle \propto$$
  
 $\overline{u}_B \left( \gamma^{\mu} F_1(Q^2) - rac{\sigma^{\mu
u} q_{
u}}{2m_B} F_2(Q^2) 
ight) u_B$ 

$$egin{aligned} G_E(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) - rac{Q^2}{2m_B} F_2(Q^2) \ G_{\mathcal{M}}(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) + F_2(Q^2) \end{aligned}$$



### Matrix element

$$\langle B; p'; s' | j^{\mu} | B; p; s 
angle \propto$$
  
 $\overline{u}_B \left( \gamma^{\mu} F_1(Q^2) - rac{\sigma^{\mu
u} q_{
u}}{2m_B} F_2(Q^2) 
ight) u_B$ 

$$egin{aligned} G_E(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) - rac{Q^2}{2m_B}\,F_2(Q^2) \ G_M(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) + F_2(Q^2) \end{aligned}$$



### Matrix element

$$\langle B; p'; s' | j^{\mu} | B; p; s 
angle \propto$$
  
 $\overline{u}_B \left( \gamma^{\mu} F_1(Q^2) - rac{\sigma^{\mu
u} q_{
u}}{2m_B} F_2(Q^2) 
ight) u_B$ 

$$egin{aligned} G_E(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) - rac{Q^2}{2m_B} \, F_2(Q^2) \ G_M(Q^2) &= F_1(Q^2) + F_2(Q^2) \end{aligned}$$

### Step 1: Construct correlation matrix

Start with basis of operators and construct a matrix of correlation functions  $G_{ij}(\mathbf{p}; \Gamma; t)$ 

#### Step 2: Perform variational analysis

Perform a variational analysis to construct optimised operators

#### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

Use these optimised operators to construct relevant three point correlation functions

#### Step 4: Extract form factors

Take ratios of three point to two point functions and extract e.g.  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$ 

## Ground state Fits to $G_E(Q^2 = 0.166(4))$ ( $m_{\pi} = 156$ MeV)



Finn M. Stokes (JSC)

## Ground state Momentum-dependence of $G_E(Q^2)$ ( $m_{\pi} = 156$ MeV)



## Ground state Fits to $G_M(Q^2 = 0.166(4))$ ( $m_{\pi} = 156$ MeV)



## Ground state Ratios of conventional $G_M(Q^2)$ plateaus to PEVA ( $m_{\pi} = 156$ MeV)



## Ground state Momentum-dependence of $G_M(Q^2)$ ( $m_{\pi} = 156$ MeV)



• We find that the form factor contributions form each quark sector to  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$  have similar  $Q^2$  dependence

- We find that the form factor contributions form each quark sector to  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$  have similar  $Q^2$  dependence
- As a result, the ratio  $G_{\mathcal{M}}(Q^2)/G_{\mathcal{E}}(Q^2)$  should have no  $Q^2$  dependence
- We find that the form factor contributions form each quark sector to  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$  have similar  $Q^2$  dependence
- As a result, the ratio  $G_M(Q^2)/G_E(Q^2)$  should have no  $Q^2$  dependence
- If this holds all the way to  $Q^2 = 0$ , we have

$$\frac{G_M(0)}{G_E(0)} = \frac{\mu}{1}$$

- We find that the form factor contributions form each quark sector to  $G_E(Q^2)$  and  $G_M(Q^2)$  have similar  $Q^2$  dependence
- As a result, the ratio  $G_{M}(Q^{2})/G_{E}(Q^{2})$  should have no  $Q^{2}$  dependence
- If this holds all the way to  $Q^2 = 0$ , we have

$$\frac{G_M(0)}{G_E(0)} = \frac{\mu}{1}$$

Effective magnetic moment

$$\mu_{\rm Eff}(Q^2) = \frac{G_M(Q^2)}{G_E(Q^2)}$$

#### Ground state Magnetic moment estimate ( $m_{\pi} = 156$ MeV)



## Ground state

Pion-mass dependence of magnetic moment



### Ground state

Pion-mass dependence of magnetic moment



First negative-parity excitation Fits to  $G_E(Q^2 = 0.142(4))$  ( $m_{\pi} = 702$  MeV)



# First negative-parity excitation

Pion-mass dependence of charge radius



### Second negative-parity excitation

Pion-mass dependence of charge radius



#### First negative-parity excitation Fits to $G_M(Q^2 = 0.142(4))$ ( $m_{\pi} = 411 \text{ MeV}$ )



Finn M. Stokes (JSC)

## First negative-parity excitation

Pion-mass dependence of magnetic moment



## Second negative-parity excitation

Pion-mass dependence of magnetic moment



# Comparison to constituent quark model $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$



# Comparison to constituent quark model $m_{\pi} = 411 \text{ MeV}$



- W.-T. Chiang, S. N. Yang, M. Vanderhaeghen and D. Drechsel, Nucl. Phys. A 723 (2003), doi:10.1016/S0375-9474(03)01160-6.
- J. Liu, J. He and Y. B. Dong, Phys. Rev. D 71 (2005), doi:10.1103/PhysRevD.71.094004.
- N. Sharma, A. Martinez Torres, K. P. Khemchandani and H. Dahiya, Eur. Phys. J. A **49** (2013), doi:10.1140/epja/i2013-13011-2.

### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

#### Matrix element

$$\begin{array}{l} \langle \beta^{-} \, ; \, \rho' \, ; \, s' | \, j^{\mu} | \, \alpha^{+} \, ; \, \rho \, ; \, s \rangle \propto \\ \overline{u}_{\beta} \left( \left( \delta^{\mu\nu} - \frac{q^{\mu} q^{\nu}}{q^{2}} \right) \gamma^{\nu} \gamma^{5} F_{1}^{*}(Q^{2}) - \frac{\sigma^{\mu\nu} q_{\nu}}{m_{\beta} - m_{\alpha}} \gamma^{5} F_{2}^{*}(Q^{2}) \right) u_{\alpha} \end{array}$$

### Step 3: Compute three point correlation function

#### Matrix element

$$\begin{array}{l} \langle \beta^{-} \, ; \, p' \, ; \, s' \, | \, j^{\mu} | \, \alpha^{+} \, ; \, p \, ; \, s \, \rangle \propto \\ \overline{u}_{\beta} \left( \left( \delta^{\mu\nu} - \frac{q^{\mu} q^{\nu}}{q^{2}} \right) \gamma^{\nu} \gamma^{5} F_{1}^{*}(Q^{2}) - \frac{\sigma^{\mu\nu} q_{\nu}}{m_{\beta} - m_{\alpha}} \gamma^{5} F_{2}^{*}(Q^{2}) \right) u_{\alpha} \end{array}$$

#### Helicity amplitudes

$$egin{aligned} &A_{1/2}(Q^2) = 2b_-\left(F_1^*(Q^2) + F_2^*(Q^2)
ight) \ &S_{1/2}(Q^2) = -\sqrt{2}b_-rac{(m_eta - m_lpha)\,|ec q|}{Q^2}\left(F_1^*(Q^2) - rac{Q^2}{m_eta - m_lpha}\,F_2^*(Q^2)
ight) \ &b_- = \sqrt{rac{Q^2 + (m_eta + m_lpha)^2}{8m_lpha(m_eta^2 - m_lpha)}} \end{aligned}$$

#### Transition to first negative parity excitation Transverse helicity amplitude at $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$



# Transition to first negative parity excitation

Transverse helicity amplitude ratio at  $m_{\pi}=702\,{
m MeV}$ 



#### Transition to first negative parity excitation Longitudinal helicity amplitude at $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$



#### Transition to second negative parity excitation Transverse helicity amplitude at $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$



# Transition to second negative parity excitation

Transverse helicity amplitude ratio at  $m_{\pi}=702\,{
m MeV}$ 



# Transition to second negative parity excitation Longitudinal helicity amplitude at $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$



# First positive-parity excitation

Pion-mass dependence of charge radius



# First positive-parity excitation

Pion-mass dependence of magnetic moment



- The PEVA technique is critical to correctly extracting
  - Form factors of nucleon excitations

- Form factors of nucleon excitations
- Precision matrix elements of ground state nucleon ( $\sim 10\%$  effect)

- Form factors of nucleon excitations
- Precision matrix elements of ground state nucleon ( $\sim 10\%$  effect)
- Two low-lying localised  $\frac{1}{2}^{-}$  nucleon excitations on the lattice

- The PEVA technique is critical to correctly extracting
  - Form factors of nucleon excitations
  - Precision matrix elements of ground state nucleon ( $\sim 10\%$  effect)
- Two low-lying localised  $\frac{1}{2}^{-}$  nucleon excitations on the lattice
  - At heavier pion masses, have magnetic moments and transition form factors consistent with quark model expectations for the  $N^*(1535)$  and  $N^*(1650)$

- The PEVA technique is critical to correctly extracting
  - Form factors of nucleon excitations
  - Precision matrix elements of ground state nucleon ( $\sim 10\%$  effect)
- Two low-lying localised  $\frac{1}{2}^{-}$  nucleon excitations on the lattice
  - At heavier pion masses, have magnetic moments and transition form factors consistent with quark model expectations for the  $N^*(1535)$  and  $N^*(1650)$
  - > At lighter pion masses, meson-baryon scattering states seem to play a more significant role

- Form factors of nucleon excitations
- $\blacktriangleright$  Precision matrix elements of ground state nucleon (  $\sim 10\%$  effect)
- Two low-lying localised  $\frac{1}{2}^{-}$  nucleon excitations on the lattice
  - At heavier pion masses, have magnetic moments and transition form factors consistent with quark model expectations for the  $N^*(1535)$  and  $N^*(1650)$
  - At lighter pion masses, meson-baryon scattering states seem to play a more significant role
- First positive-parity excitation observed is consistent with a radial excitation of the ground state nucleon

- Form factors of nucleon excitations
- $\blacktriangleright$  Precision matrix elements of ground state nucleon (  $\sim 10\%$  effect)
- Two low-lying localised  $\frac{1}{2}^{-}$  nucleon excitations on the lattice
  - At heavier pion masses, have magnetic moments and transition form factors consistent with quark model expectations for the  $N^*(1535)$  and  $N^*(1650)$
  - At lighter pion masses, meson-baryon scattering states seem to play a more significant role
- First positive-parity excitation observed is consistent with a radial excitation of the ground state nucleon
- Inclusion of multi-particle scattering operators is important

# $\label{eq:energy} \mbox{ First negative parity excitation - } {\it p}^2 \simeq 0.166 \, {\rm GeV}^2$



Finn M. Stokes (JSC)

#### First negative-parity excitation Momentum-dependence of $G_E(Q^2)$ ( $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$ )



#### Second negative-parity excitation Fits to $G_E(Q^2 = 0.142(4))$ ( $m_{\pi} = 702 \text{ MeV}$ )



#### Second negative-parity excitation Fits to $G_M(Q^2 = 0.142(4))$ ( $m_{\pi} = 702$ MeV)



Finn M. Stokes (JSC)
# Comparison to constituent quark model $m_{\pi} = 296 \text{ MeV}$



$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{\pm}} e^{-\mathcal{E}_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{\pm}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{\pm}} \frac{-i \gamma \cdot \boldsymbol{p} \pm m_{B^{\pm}}}{2\mathcal{E}_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$$

• Introduce  $\Gamma_{\pm} = (\gamma_4 \pm \mathbb{I})/2$  and define  $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{\pm}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \text{Tr} (\Gamma_{\pm} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t))$ 

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{\pm}} e^{-E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{\pm}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{\pm}} \frac{-i\gamma \cdot \boldsymbol{p} \pm m_{B^{\pm}}}{2E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$$
  
• Introduce  $\Gamma_{\pm} = (\gamma_4 \pm \mathbb{I})/2$  and define  $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{\pm}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \text{Tr} \left(\Gamma_{\pm} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)\right)$   
 $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$   
 $+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_j^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$ 

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{\pm}} e^{-E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{\pm}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{\pm}} \frac{-i \gamma \cdot \boldsymbol{p} \pm m_{B^{\pm}}}{2E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$$
  
• Introduce  $\Gamma_{\pm} = (\gamma_4 \pm \mathbb{I})/2$  and define  $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{\pm}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \text{Tr} \left(\Gamma_{\pm} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)\right)$   
 $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$   
 $+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$ 

$$\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{\pm}} e^{-E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{\pm}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{\pm}} \frac{-i \gamma \cdot \boldsymbol{p} \pm m_{B^{\pm}}}{2E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$$
  
• Introduce  $\Gamma_{\pm} = (\gamma_4 \pm \mathbb{I})/2$  and define  $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{\pm}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \text{Tr} \left(\Gamma_{\pm} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)\right)$   
 $G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) = \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$   
 $+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_i^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_j^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})}$ 

۲

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p};\,t) &= \sum_{B^{\pm}} \mathrm{e}^{-E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})\,t}\,\lambda_{i}^{B^{\pm}}\,\overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{\pm}}\,\frac{-i\,\gamma\cdot\boldsymbol{p}\pm\boldsymbol{m}_{B^{\pm}}}{2E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ \text{Introduce } \boldsymbol{\Gamma}_{\pm} &= (\gamma_{4}\pm\mathbb{I})/2 \text{ and define } \boldsymbol{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\Gamma}_{\pm};\boldsymbol{p};\,t) \equiv \mathrm{Tr}\left(\boldsymbol{\Gamma}_{\pm}\,\mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p};\,t)\right) \\ \boldsymbol{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\Gamma}_{+};\boldsymbol{p};\,t) &= \sum_{B^{+}} \mathrm{e}^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})\,t}\,\lambda_{i}^{B^{+}}\,\overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}}\,\frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})+\boldsymbol{m}_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ &+ \sum_{B^{-}} \mathrm{e}^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})\,t}\,\lambda_{i}^{B^{-}}\,\overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}}\,\frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})-\boldsymbol{m}_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ \boldsymbol{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{\Gamma}_{-};\boldsymbol{p};\,t) &= \sum_{B^{+}} \mathrm{e}^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})\,t}\,\lambda_{i}^{B^{+}}\,\overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}}\,\frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})-\boldsymbol{m}_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ &+ \sum_{B^{-}} \mathrm{e}^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})\,t}\,\lambda_{i}^{B^{-}}\,\overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}}\,\frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})+\boldsymbol{m}_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \end{aligned}$$

۲

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) &= \sum_{B^{\pm}} e^{-E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{\pm}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{\pm}} \frac{-i \gamma \cdot \boldsymbol{p} \pm m_{B^{\pm}}}{2E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ \text{Introduce } \Gamma_{\pm} &= (\gamma_{4} \pm \mathbb{I})/2 \text{ and define } G_{ij}(\Gamma_{\pm}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \text{Tr} \left(\Gamma_{\pm} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)\right) \\ G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) &= \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ &+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ G_{ij}(\Gamma_{-}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) &= \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ &+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \end{aligned}$$

۲

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t) &= \sum_{B^{\pm}} e^{-E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{\pm}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{\pm}} \frac{-i \gamma \cdot \boldsymbol{p} \pm m_{B^{\pm}}}{2E_{B^{\pm}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ \text{Introduce } \Gamma_{\pm} &= (\gamma_{4} \pm \mathbb{I})/2 \text{ and define } G_{ij}(\Gamma_{\pm}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) \equiv \text{Tr} \left(\Gamma_{\pm} \mathcal{G}_{ij}(\boldsymbol{p}; t)\right) \\ G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) &= \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ &+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ G_{ij}(\Gamma_{-}; \boldsymbol{p}; t) &= \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}} \frac{E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p}) - m_{B^{+}}}{2E_{B^{+}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \\ &+ \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}} \frac{E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p}) + m_{B^{-}}}{2E_{B^{-}}(\boldsymbol{p})} \end{aligned}$$

#### Zero momentum

• At zero momentum,  $E_B(\mathbf{0}) = m_B$ , so

$$rac{E_B({f 0})+m_B}{2E_B({f 0})}=1$$
  
 $rac{E_B({f 0})-m_B}{2E_B({f 0})}=0$ 

#### Zero momentum

• At zero momentum,  $E_B(\mathbf{0}) = m_B$ , so

$$egin{aligned} & rac{E_B(\mathbf{0})+m_B}{2E_B(\mathbf{0})} = 1 \ & rac{E_B(\mathbf{0})-m_B}{2E_B(\mathbf{0})} = 0 \end{aligned}$$

• So projected correlators only contain terms for states of a single parity

$$G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \mathbf{0}; t) = \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-m_{B^{+}}t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}}$$
$$G_{ij}(\Gamma_{-}; \mathbf{0}; t) = \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-m_{B^{-}}t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}}$$

#### Zero momentum

• At zero momentum,  $E_B(\mathbf{0}) = m_B$ , so

$$egin{aligned} & rac{E_B(\mathbf{0})+m_B}{2E_B(\mathbf{0})} = 1 \ & rac{E_B(\mathbf{0})-m_B}{2E_B(\mathbf{0})} = 0 \end{aligned}$$

• So projected correlators only contain terms for states of a single parity

$$G_{ij}(\Gamma_{+}; \mathbf{0}; t) = \sum_{B^{+}} e^{-m_{B^{+}}t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{+}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{+}}$$
$$G_{ij}(\Gamma_{-}; \mathbf{0}; t) = \sum_{B^{-}} e^{-m_{B^{-}}t} \lambda_{i}^{B^{-}} \overline{\lambda}_{j}^{B^{-}}$$

• Can analyse states of each parity independently

Finn M. Stokes (JSC)